

OXFORD

Promise, Trust, and Evolution

Managing the Commons of South Asia



Edited by Rucha Ghate, Narpat S. Jodha, and Pranab Mukhopadhyay

Promise, Trust, and Evolution

This page intentionally left blank

Promise, Trust, and Evolution

Managing the Commons
of South Asia

Edited by

Rucha Ghatge, Narpal S. Jodha, and
Pranab Mukhopadhyay

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© Oxford University Press 2008

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted
Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2008

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Data available

Typeset by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India
Printed in Great Britain
on acid-free paper by
Biddles Ltd., King's Lynn, Norfolk

ISBN 978-0-19-921383-2

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Preface

This volume brings together research on common property resources (CPR) and the institutions that manage them, by grantees, advisors, and associates of the South Asian Network for Environmental and Development Economics (SANDEE). The focus of SANDEE since its inception in 1999 has been to build capacity by providing training and research grants in order to address the environmental issues associated with problems of poverty and development in South Asia. A major share of the early grants made by SANDEE was in the area of CPR research and the first set of working papers started trickling in around 2003. Though there is a routine process of dissemination of research findings by the secretariat as well as the researchers it was but a natural next step to put together a volume for wider and consolidated dissemination.

It was meant to be an easy task in the beginning since all SANDEE Working Papers are peer reviewed before publication, so the editorial effort for this volume seemed negligible to start with. However, we soon realized that while there were numerous papers on CPRs from India, Nepal, and Sri Lanka, there were gaps in other countries. There were no ready studies available from the grantees in other parts of South Asia (like Bangladesh, Bhutan, and Pakistan) on the commons. We decided at this point that we should invite SANDEE's associates and resource people to also contribute to this volume.

Carmen Wickramagamage helped us with the language editing of the papers despite her own time constraints as she moved house from Sri Lanka to the USA. Deepshikha Mehra at SHODH was marvellous with her format editing and made sure that all t's were crossed and i's dotted. Jennifer Wilkinson, Carol Bestley, and Sarah Baker at OUP were very supportive through the whole production process.

Karl Goran Maler and Monica Eberle hosted us at the Abdus Salam International Centre for Theoretical Physics, Trieste for the paper-writers' workshop and Rosa Del Rio did a great job coordinating this workshop. This was a follow-up of earlier meetings held at the Institute of Social and Economic Change (Bangalore), Institute of Economic Growth (New Delhi) and the International Centre (Goa) facilitated by SANDEE. E. Somanathan and Ingella Tergstrom helped us iron out many of the glitches that came up. We are grateful to them for their time and effort.

Preface

It is a marvel of technology and SANDEE's unwavering support that has allowed three geographically far-flung editors to bring together this volume. Anuradha Kafle and Kavita Shrestha took our demands on their time in their stride. Manik Duggar with his infectious smile and endless energy left midway through this book project. We missed his absence as a friend, colleague, and contributor. Priya Shyamsundar not only contributed a paper but also lent a shoulder to lean on whenever the need arose. SHODH had the lead responsibility of coordinating the book effort and it seamlessly moved between the academic and the executive needs of the book.

Rucha Ghate, Narpat S. Jodha,
and Pranab Mukhopadhyay

March 2007, Nagpur–Kathmandu–Goa

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiv

Introduction	1
--------------	---

Part I Issues and Challenges

1. Common Property Resources: Economic Analytics	19
<i>Partha Dasgupta</i>	
2. Some Places Again: A 'Restricted' Revisit to Dry Regions of India	51
<i>Narpat S. Jodha</i>	
3. Decentralization, Devolution, and Collective Action—A Review of International Experience	70
<i>Priya Shyamsundar</i>	

Part II Evolution and Transitions

4. Does Afforestation Ensure Sustainability? A Study of the Haors of Bangladesh	99
<i>A. K. Enamul Haque</i>	
5. A Tale of Three Villages: Practised Forestry in India	122
<i>Rucha Ghate</i>	
6. The Stake-Net Fishery Association of Negombo Lagoon, Sri Lanka: Why Has It Survived over 250 Years and Will It Survive another 100 Years?	144
<i>Asha Gunawardena and Paul Steele</i>	
7. Transaction Costs and Institutional Innovation: Sustainability of Tank Aquaculture in Sri Lanka	165
<i>Athula Senaratne and Kalpa Karunanayake</i>	

Contents

8. Irrigation Management—Does Bottom Up Work Better than Top Down in Sri Lanka? <i>Gamini Herath</i>	191
Part III Livelihoods and Distribution	
9. Heterogeneity, Commons, and Privatization: Agrarian Institutional Change in Goa <i>Pranab Mukhopadhyay</i>	213
10. Is Cooperation Costly with Diverse Economic Agents? <i>Bhim Adhikari</i>	238
11. Who Pays for Conservation: Evidence from Forestry in Nepal <i>Arun Khatri-Chhetri</i>	260
12. Community Tanks vs Private Wells: Coping Strategies and Sustainability Issues in South India <i>R. Balasubramanian</i>	283
Part IV Statutory and Customary Law	
13. Tradition and Sovereignty: Conflicts over the Forests of Dir-Kohistan <i>Shaheen Rafi Khan</i>	307
14. Is the State Passé? Competing Domains in Forestry in Orissa <i>Arabinda Mishra</i>	330
15. Efficiency and Low Costs Under Non-Limiting Supply Conditions in Bhutan <i>Edward L. Webb and Lam Dorji</i>	352
16. So Far So Good: Next Steps in Community Forestry <i>Keshav Raj Kanel</i>	370
<i>Index</i>	391

List of Figures

1.1. Equilibrium grazing in the unmanaged common	26
1.2. Allocation of grazing profits in the managed and unmanaged common	28
4.1. Location of the Hakaluki <i>Haor</i>	104
4.2. Value of economic and ecological services due to afforestation	112
4.3. Value of economic and ecological services due to establishment of the fish sanctuary	113
4.4. Value of economic and ecological services due to sedimentation control	114
4.5a. Value of economic and ecological services due to sedimentation control, afforestation, and establishment of the fish sanctuary (Scenario 6)	115
4.5b. Value of economic and ecological services due to sedimentation control, afforestation, establishment of the fish sanctuary, and construction of the embankment (Scenario 7)	116
4.6a. Comparison of changes in NPV under different management options for 30 years of life of the management plan	117
4.6b. NPV under different management options	117
7.1. Share of transaction cost under different institutional arrangements	177
9.1. Type of cultivation in area (hectares and percentage)	218
9.2. Government expenditure incurred in embankment maintenance (in Rs million)	220
9.3. Land ownership distribution	227
9.4. Cumulative migration abroad (survey data). Year 1958–2001	228
9.5. Cumulative number of persons reporting fallow area. Year 1977–2001	231
10.1. Land inequality and transaction costs	249
16.1. Pattern of handing over of community forests	377

List of Tables

2.1. Number of districts and villages covered by 'restricted revisit' to CPRs in dry regions of India	52
2.2. Differences and links between the two studies	53
2.3. Summary of main findings of CPR study 1982–5 and some changes noted during 'revisit'	55
2.4. Details on CPR units reflecting positive changes during 1996–2003	56
2.5. Policy-induced factors and processes facilitating improved (CPR-unit-based) management of CPRs	60
3.1. Impacts of decentralized natural resource management	75
3.2. Differing characteristics of resources and communities and implications for governance and benefits distribution	83
3.3. Some challenges and solutions associated with decentralized natural resource management	88
4.1. Fishing rights in the <i>Beels</i>	105
4.2. Rate of silt deposits in the <i>Beels</i> of Hakaluki <i>Haor</i>	106
4.3. Economic and ecological services from Hakaluki <i>Haor</i>	111
4.4. Comparative analysis of benefits from Hakaluki <i>Haor</i> management policies and their impact	112
4.5. Sustainability and efficiency trade-offs for <i>Haor</i> management	115
5.1. A summary of process analysis	137
6.1. Membership of the SNFA	148
6.2. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under resource system characteristics with respect to SNFA	150
6.3. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under group characteristics to the SNFA	151
6.4. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under relationship between resource system and group characteristics to the SNFA	152
6.5. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under institutional arrangements to the SNFA	153
6.6. Resource rights and allocation methods	154

6.7. Rules for membership	154
6.8. Distribution of channels among stake-net fishery subgroups	155
6.9. Enforcement of rules	158
6.10. Social supportive work	159
6.11. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under relationship between resource system and institutional arrangements to the SNFA	159
6.12. Application of Agrawal's critical enabling conditions listed under conditions of external environment of the SNFA	160
6.13. Common features of and differences between the societies of SNFA	162
7.1. A socio-economic profile of households surveyed	171
7.2. Transactions in community-based aquaculture in village irrigation tanks	173
7.3. Methods of estimating transaction costs	174
7.4. Transaction cost under different institutional arrangements (land per cycle of production)	178
7.5. Relative contribution by community-based aquaculture	180
7.6. Economic performance of three institutional arrangements	180
7.7. Results of the extended net margin analysis in tanks	181
7.8. Distribution of benefits of community-based aquaculture among participants and organizations	183
7.9. Constraints for community-based aquaculture	186
8.1. Summary of achievements in the case studies presented	206
9.1. Distribution of land under private and <i>comunidade</i> ownership (prior to land reforms)	217
9.2. Main sources of income and expenditures of the <i>comunidades</i>	219
9.3. Average landholding by category in hectares (survey results 2002–3)	225
9.4. <i>Taluka</i> -wise distribution of <i>comunidade</i> plots (in hectares) (prior to Tenancy Reforms)	226
9.5. Persons with family abroad and receiving foreign remittances (current survey data)	228
9.6. Description of variables and expected signs	229
9.7. Summary of statistics	229
9.8. Summary of regression results	230
9.9. Persons with fallow lands and having family abroad (current survey data)	231
9.10. Distribution of fallow land among different categories	233
9.11. <i>Taluka</i> -wise total income, expenditures, and balances of <i>comunidades</i> (in Rs for the period 1954–63)	234
10.1. Area of holding by land-use pattern (hectares)	244

List of Tables

10.2. Characteristics of sample respondents	245
10.3. Breakdown of transaction costs for each FUG assessed (days)	247
10.4. Land and caste inequality and transaction costs (days)	248
10.5. Transaction costs and local differences	250
10.6. Transaction costs and the degree of collective action	252
11.1. Descriptive statistics	269
11.2. Institutional arrangements in two types of forest management system	271
11.3. Rules and regulations in forest products extraction and management	271
11.4. Annual average income by economic activity and wealth group (Nepalese rupees)	273
11.5. Average value of NTFPs collected by households (NRs)	274
11.6. Distribution of net income from NTFP extraction based on wealth group (NRs)	275
11.7. Contribution of NTFPs extracted from common property to total household gross income based on wealth group	275
11.8. Effect of income level on total NTFP extraction and dependence on NTFPs	276
11.9. Definition of explanatory variables	277
11.10. Determinants of NTFPs income from the forest	278
12.1. Definition of variables used, descriptive statistics, and hypothesis	292
12.2. Summary of statistics, definitions, and hypothesis for the variables used	294
12.3. Factors affecting tank degradation in Tamil Nadu state and Ramanathapuram district	295
12.4. Poverty and dependence on tanks	296
12.5. Revenue obtained from tank usufructs and its utilization (Rs/ha of command area)	297
12.6. Private wells in the tank command and the extent of dependence on community tanks	298
12.7. Extent of participation of households in tank maintenance work (average for the years 1999–2000 and 2000–1)	299
12.8. Factors affecting persistence of traditional irrigation institutions—results of probit regression analysis	300
12.9. Factors affecting collective action in tank maintenance	301
13.1. Dir-Kohistan land-use classification	310
13.2. Human development indicators (HDI) in the NWFP	311
14.1. A comparison of the institutional aspects of different management paradigms currently acting on Orissa's forests	344
14.2. Distribution of the monetary value of forest goods collected across different income groups under community management of the <i>Sulia</i>	347

15.1. Annual household in-kind taxes paid in village Taksha-Sili-Tsara prior to 1950s	357
15.2. Composition, density, and relative abundance of tree species in non- <i>sokshing</i> natural forest and <i>sokshing</i> forest in the middle Himalayan broadleaf forest of Bhutan	359
15.3. <i>De jure</i> and <i>de facto</i> rights of communities over non- <i>sokshing</i> and <i>sokshing</i> forests before and after the Bhutan Forest Act of 1969	364
16.1. Key differences between the hills and the <i>Terai</i>	375
16.2. Forest products harvested, used within, and sold outside the CFUG	379
16.3. Distribution of annual income (Rs in millions) of CFUGs	380
16.4. Distribution of annual expenditure (Rs in millions) of CFUGs	381
16.5. Participation of CFUG members in community forestry activities	383

List of Contributors

Bhim Adhikari, University of Michigan, USA

R. Balasubramanian, Tamil Nadu Agricultural University, India

Partha Dasgupta, Cambridge University, U.K.

Lam Dorji, Royal Society for Protection of Nature (RSPN), Bhutan

Rucha Ghate, SHODH: The Institute for Research and Development, India

Asha Gunawardena, Institute of Policy Studies, Sri Lanka

A. K. Enamul Haque, East West University, Bangladesh

Gamini Herath, Deakin University, Australia

Narpat S. Jodha, International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development, Nepal

Keshav Raj Kanel, Forest Department, Nepal

Kalpa Karunanayake, Department of Inland Revenue, Sri Lanka

Shaheen Rafi Khan, Sustainable Development Policy Institute, Pakistan

Arun Khatri-Chhetri, West Virginia University, USA

Arabinda Mishra, TERI University, India

Pranab Mukhopadhyay, Goa University, India and South Asian Network for Environmental Economics, Nepal

Athula Senaratne, National Aquaculture Development Authority, Sri Lanka

Priya Shyamsundar, South Asian Network for Development and Environmental Economics, Nepal

Paul Steele, United Nations Development Programme, Sri Lanka

Edward L. Webb, Asian Institute of Technology, Thailand